
Submission on Napier City Proposed District Plan

Form 5 Submission on publically notified proposal for policy statement or plan, change or variation

Clause 6 of Schedule 1, Resource Management Act 1991

To: Napier City Council - Planning Unit

Date received: 08/12/2023

Submission Reference Number #:79

This is a submission on the following proposed plan (the **proposal**): Napier City Proposed District Plan

Submitter:

Joanne Black

Address for service:

Joanne Black
35 Vigor Brown Street Napier South Napier 4110
New Zealand

Email: dalejo.black@gmail.com

I wish to be heard: No

I am willing to present a joint case: No

Could you gain an advantage in trade competition in making this submission?

- **No**

Are you directly affected by an effect of the subject matter of the submission that

(a) adversely affects the environment; and

(b) does not relate to trade competition or the effects of trade competition

- **N/A**

Submission points

Point 79.1

Section: HRZ - High Density Residential Zone

Sub-section: Objectives

Provision:

HRZ-04: Neighbourhood character and identity

Development contributes to the creation of neighbourhoods with a high-density residential built character, comprising residential buildings generally up to six storeys integrated with onsite landscaped areas.

Relates to GRZ-12 and GRZ-14

Sentiment: Oppose

Submission:

I oppose the proposed zone area in Napier South for High density residential dwellings. I live in Vigor Brown Street in a section that is to be zoned high density and feel the character and history of this area should be preserved and protected by making the area of Vigor Brown Street between Carnell Street to Kennedy Road and Kennedy Road to Latham Street, along with Winifred Street, a general residential zone with the addition of a heritage overlay. The homes in this area date back over 100 years and have withstood the 1931 earthquake and are a piece of Napier's history that cannot be replaced once demolished or removed for a high density dwelling. The building of up to a 19.5 metre apartment style dwelling next to a 100 year old Villa would completely spoil the history and character of the homes in the area. In 2019, the Napier City Council commissioned a report by registered architect Graham Linwood (Napier Heritage Character Areas Study) with its purpose being: " As part of the Napier District Plan Review, Napier City Council is undertaking a review of Napier's current heritage character areas, as well as a review of additional parts of the City that may have additional character areas that could be identified and protected in some form."

When referring to Napier South, this report goes on to say:

"Napier South's built environment reflects the building styles, materials availability, and societal patterns and needs of the time. The majority of housing is single story Villas and Bungalows on larger sections. Some streets have beautiful tree-lined avenues, and corner or neighbourhood shops are a feature of the suburb. Despite the popularity of this suburb, there has been little modern development, and the majority of older homes remain unmolested. It is clear that one of the reasons people live in this suburb is because of the character that exists. The majority of homes are well cared for or have been restored. There is however, a risk that the character may be altered in the future, as the large sites and proximity to the city will make it attractive to developers for medium-density housing developments."

The report then concludes:

"The loss or erosion of character within these areas of Napier, a city unique in its progressive development over time, would be very unfortunate for Napier.

I submit that the council has already sought and obtained the opinion of a registered architect as to the value of the history of the housing in Napier South and that report clearly states that the history in Napier South, and specifically in MacDonald Street between Kennedy Road and Carnell Street and Vigor Brown Street between Carnell Street and Latham Street, is of historic value and should be protected. The council in its proposed district plan is proposing to give general residence zoning with a heritage overlay to MacDonald Street between Carnell Street and Kennedy Road but is proposing to make the same section of Vigor Brown Street High Density, which completely disregards this report. There is no difference between the two streets with regards to the historic qualities and style and era of housing.

Relief sought

I wish for the council to change the proposed high density zone for Vigor Brown Street & Winfred Street in Napier South, to be zoned General residential with a historic overlay, in the same way they already have done for MacDonald Street between Carnell Street and Kennedy Road. There is no difference in the history or character of the homes in these streets and the council itself commissioned a report in 2019 by registered architect Graham Linwood (Heritage Review) which concluded this.

Point 79.2

Section: HH - Historic heritage

Sub-section: Objectives

Provision:

HH-O3: Historic heritage streetscapes and groups of buildings and items

The historic heritage values of identified streetscapes and groups, including the contribution made by individual historic heritage items, is protected from inappropriate use and development.

Relates to HH-I1 and HH-I3

Sentiment: Amend

Submission:

I oppose the proposed zone area in Napier South for High density residential dwellings. I live in Vigor Brown Street in a section that is to be zoned high density and feel the character and history of this area should be preserved and protected by making the area of Vigor Brown Street between Carnell Street to Kennedy Road and Kennedy Road to Latham Street, along with Winifred Street, a general residential zone with the addition of a heritage overlay. The homes in this area date back over 100 years and have withstood the 1931 earthquake and are a piece of Napier's history that cannot be replaced once demolished or removed for a high density dwelling. The building of up to a 19.5 metre apartment style dwelling next to a 100 year old Villa would completely spoil the history and character of the homes in the area. In 2019, the Napier City Council commissioned a report by registered architect Graham Linwood (Napier Heritage Character Areas Study) with its purpose being: "As part of the Napier District Plan Review, Napier City Council is undertaking a review of Napier's current heritage character areas, as well as a review of additional parts of the City that may have additional character areas that could be identified and protected in some form."

When referring to Napier South, this report goes on to say:

"Napier South's built environment reflects the building styles, materials availability, and societal patterns and needs of the time. The majority of housing is single story Villas and Bungalows on larger sections. Some streets have beautiful tree-lined avenues, and corner or neighbourhood shops are a feature of the suburb. Despite the popularity of this suburb, there has been little modern development, and the majority of older homes remain unmolested. It is clear that one of the reasons people live in this suburb is because of the character that exists. The majority of homes are well cared for or have been restored. There is however, a risk that the character may be altered in the future, as the large sites and proximity to the city will make it attractive to developers for medium-density housing developments."

The report then concludes:

"The loss or erosion of character within these areas of Napier, a city unique in its progressive development over time, would be

very unfortunate for Napier.

I submit that the council has already sought and obtained the opinion of a registered architect as to the value of the history of the housing in Napier South and that report clearly states that the history in Napier South, and specifically in MacDonald Street between Kennedy Road and Carnell Street and Vigor Brown Street between Carnell Street and Latham Street, is of historic value and should be protected. The council in its proposed district plan is proposing to give general residence zoning with a heritage overlay to MacDonald Street between Carnell Street and Kennedy Road but is proposing to make the same section of Vigor Brown Street High Density, which completely disregards this report. There is no difference between the two streets with regards to the historic qualities and style and era of housing.

Relief sought

I wish for the council to change the proposed high density zone for Vigor Brown Street & Winfred Street in Napier South, to be zoned General residential with a historic overlay, in the same way they already have done for MacDonald Street between Carnell Street and Kennedy Road. There is no difference in the history or character of the homes in these streets and the council itself commissioned a report in 2019 by registered architect Graham Linwood (Heritage Review) which concluded this.

Point 79.3

Section: Planning Maps

Sub-section: General

Provision: General

Sentiment: Amend

Submission:

I oppose the proposed zone area in Napier South for High density residential dwellings. I live in Vigor Brown Street in a section that is to be zoned high density and feel the character and history of this area should be preserved and protected by making the area of Vigor Brown Street between Carnell Street to Kennedy Road and Kennedy Road to Latham Street, along with Winifred Street, a general residential zone with the addition of a heritage overlay. The homes in this area date back over 100 years and have withstood the 1931 earthquake and are a piece of Napier's history that cannot be replaced once demolished or removed for a high density dwelling. The building of up to a 19.5 metre apartment style dwelling next to a 100 year old Villa would completely spoil the history and character of the homes in the area. In 2019, the Napier City Council commissioned a report by registered architect Graham Linwood (Napier Heritage Character Areas Study) with its purpose being: " As part of the Napier District Plan Review, Napier City Council is undertaking a review of Napier's current heritage character areas, as well as a review of additional parts of the City that may have additional character areas that could be identified and protected in some form."

When referring to Napier South, this report goes on to say:

"Napier South's built environment reflects the building styles, materials availability, and societal patterns and needs of the time. The majority of housing is single story Villas and Bungalows on larger sections. Some streets have beautiful tree-lined avenues, and corner or neighbourhood shops are a feature of the suburb. Despite the popularity of this suburb, there has been little modern development, and the majority of older homes remain unmolested. It is clear that one of the reasons people live in this suburb is because of the character that exists. The majority of homes are well cared for or have been restored. There is however, a risk that the character may be altered in the future, as the large sites and proximity to the city will make it attractive to developers for medium-density housing developments."

The report then concludes:

"The loss or erosion of character within these areas of Napier, a city unique in its progressive development over time, would be very unfortunate for Napier.

I submit that the council has already sought and obtained the opinion of a registered architect as to the value of the history of the housing in Napier South and that report clearly states that the history in Napier South, and specifically in MacDonald Street between Kennedy Road and Carnell Street and Vigor Brown Street between Carnell Street and Latham Street, is of historic value and should be protected. The council in its proposed district plan is proposing to give general residence zoning with a heritage overlay to MacDonald Street between Carnell Street and Kennedy Road but is proposing to make the same section of Vigor Brown Street High Density, which

completely disregards this report. There is no difference between the two streets with regards to the historic qualities and style and era of housing.

Relief sought

I wish for the council to change the proposed high density zone for Vigor Brown Street & Winfred Street in Napier South, to be zoned General residential with a historic overlay, in the same way they already have done for MacDonald Street between Carnell Street and Kennedy Road. There is no difference in the history or character of the homes in these streets and the council itself commissioned a report in 2019 by registered architect Graham Linwood (Heritage Review) which concluded this.