

5. REPRESENTATION REVIEW - ADDITIONAL OPTIONS

<i>Type of Report:</i>	Information
<i>Legal Reference:</i>	Local Electoral Act 2001
<i>Document ID:</i>	461856
<i>Reporting Officer/s & Unit:</i>	Jane McLoughlin, Team Leader Governance Rachael Horton, Manager Business Excellence & Transformation

5.1 Purpose of Report

To provide information to Elected Members on additional options for their consideration for the Representation Review.

Officer's Recommendation

That Council

- a. Note the additional Representation Review options:
 - (i) Moving Awatoto into Ahuriri Ward, and Tamatea South into Taradale Ward:
 - of a mixed system with eight Elected Members split over three Wards and four at large Elected Members (outlined in table 2)
 - of a ward-only system with 8 or 12 Elected Members in total (outlined in tables 3-4)
 - (ii) In addition to the above movements of suburbs, move Poraiti and Meeanee into Ahuriri Ward:
 - of a mixed system with nine Elected Members split over three wards and 3 at large Elected Members (outlined in table 7)
 - of a ward-only system with 12 Elected Members in total (outlined in table 8).
- b. Note the importance of ensuring effective representation for communities of interest.

Mayor's/Chairperson's Recommendation

That the Council resolve that the officer's recommendation be adopted.

5.2 Background Summary

After the Finance Committee on 20 March 2018, Councillor Jeffery requested further information on a mixed system with a three ward option which avoided single-member wards. Taking "Option B – feasible" from the Addendum paper, an attachment to the Representation Report to the Finance Committee (page 169 refers), Officers checked whether moving two suburbs into different wards was feasible.

Subsequently, Officers were asked about the feasibility of this ward structure for a ward-only system.

In doing so, Officers also found a similar ward configuration which is feasible.

Effective representation

As outlined in the Addendum paper, and in the Council Report and analysis paper, representation options must be assessed first and foremost against effective representation for communities of interest, and then what options are considered fair in terms of equality of votes for the public.

Councillors are reminded to pay particular consideration to the criteria as outlined in the Addendum paper on page 166 when considering ward structures for effective representation of communities of interest e.g.

- Avoiding arrangements that may create barriers to participation
- Not splitting recognised communities of interest between electoral subdivisions
- Not grouping together two or more communities of interest that have few common interest
- Accessibility, size and configuration of the area.

3 Ward Option (Option B - feasible – as outlined on page 169 of the Finance Committee agenda, 20 March 2018 refers).

Table 1: Mixed system, 3 Wards, 4 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park	15,100	2	7,550	-198	-2.55
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Tamatea North & South, Pirimai	24,190	3	8,063	316	4.08
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Poraiti, Meeanee, Awatoto	22,690	3	7,563	-184	-2.38
Sub-total	61,980	8	7,748		
At large	61,980	4	15,495		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

The option of moving Tamatea South to Taradale Ward, and moving Awatoto to Ahuriri Ward was explored. As outlined in the table below, this option is feasible.

Table 2: New option, Mixed System, 3 Wards, 4 At Large Elected members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto	15,450	2	7,725	-23	-0.29
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	3	7,140	-608	-7.84
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Poraiti, Meeanee, Tamatea South	25,110	3	8,370	623	8.03
Sub-total	61,980	8	7,748		
At large	61,980	4	15,495		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Advantages of this option:

- Improved population/member ratio for Onekawa Ward compared with the previous option.
- Tamatea South aligns more closely with Taradale Ward socio-economic indicators than with Onekawa Ward.
- Awatoto is coastal and area of residential growth.
- Could decrease the number of At Large Elected Members from four to three, or two without affecting the ward population/member ratios.

Disadvantages of this option:

- Over 75% of those surveyed in the pre-consultation were able to name their Ward.
- Tamatea residents likely not to be able to differentiate between which suburb they are in e.g. Tamatea North and South, and therefore which ward they sit in, and investment will need to be made into a communications plan if a change of this nature is made.
- Awatoto is right next to Meeanee which also shares similar land use.
- Nelson Park and McLean Park share similar deprivation ratings to suburbs in the Onekawa Ward.

Councillor Boag requested Officers to look at what configurations are possible under a ward-only system using the above ward structure. Under a Ward-only system, the following two configurations are feasible:

Table 3: Three wards, 8 Elected Members in total

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto	15,450	2	7,725	-23	-0.29
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	3	7,140	-608	-7.84
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Poraiti, Meeanee, Tamatea South	25,110	3	8,370	623	8.03
Total	61,980	8	7,748		

Table 4: Three wards, 12 Elected Members in total

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto	15,450	3	5,150	-15	-0.29
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	4	5,355	190	3.68
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Poraiti, Meeanee, Tamatea South	25,110	5	5,022	-143	-2.77
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Under a Ward-only system, the following two configurations are not feasible:

Table 5: Ward-only, 12 Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto	15,450	4	3,863	-1,303	-25.22
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	4	5,355	190	3.68
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Poraiti, Meeanee, Tamatea South	25,110	4	6,278	1,113	21.54

Total	61,980	12	5,165		
--------------	---------------	-----------	--------------	--	--

Table 6: Ward-only, 11 Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto	15,450	3	5,150	-485	-8.60
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	4	5,355	-280	-4.96
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Poraiti, Meeanee, Tamatea South	25,110	4	6,278	643	11.41
Total	61,980	11	5,635		

New three ward structure for consideration

Using the ward structure proposed by Councillor Jeffery as a basis, but move Meeanee and Poraiti into Ahuriri Ward. Particular advantages/disadvantages of moving Meeanee and Poraiti into Ahuriri Ward are outlined below (and should be read in conjunction with the advantages/disadvantages as outlined earlier).

Advantages

- brings Meeanee, Poraiti, Awatoto and Bayview (all rural-residential, and growth areas) into the same ward rather than splitting them across a couple of wards.
- Meeanee and Poraiti are among the lowest deprivation so align either with Taradale or Ahuriri Wards.

Disadvantages

- Ahuriri Ward encompasses a large geographical area across Napier.

Table 7: Feasible – mixed system

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto, Meeanee, Poraiti	19,590	3	6,530	-357	-5.18
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	3	7,140	253	3.68
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows,, Tamatea South	20,970	3	6,990	103	1.50
<i>Sub-total</i>		9	6,887		
At Large		3*	20,660		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

*The configuration under Ward-only is also feasible, e.g. 3 Elected Members per ward, giving a total of 9 Elected Members.

Table 8: Feasible – Ward only, 12 Elected Members in total

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto, Meeanee, Poraiti	19,590	4	4,898	-268	-5.18
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	4	5,243	78	1.50
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows,, Tamatea South	20,970	4	5,355	190	3.68
Total		12	5,165		

Table 9: Not feasible – Ward only, 11 Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Awatoto, Meeanee, Poraiti	19,590	3	6,530	895	15.89
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa Central/West/South, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai, Tamatea North	21,420	4	5,355	-280	-4.96
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows,, Tamatea South	20,970	4	5,243	-392	-6.96
Total		11	5,635		

5.3 Attachments

Nil