

Representation Review - addendum

1. At the Seminar with Elected Members on 7 March 2018, Elected Members asked officials to look into the following:
 - A) Whether 3 wards could be justified in terms of effective representation - and the 3 wards could be used in a mixed system with no single-member wards, and the total of Elected Members to remain at 12.
 - B) Whether there are any options for retaining a mixed system with the current ward structure, with no single-member wards, and reducing the number of At Large Elected Members (possibly to 4) to retain a total of 12 Elected Members.

A) Mixed system – under a 3 ward structure

Effective representation

2. As outlined in the analysis paper, we know that the current ward structure broadly accommodates for communities of interest under the following factors as referenced in the Guidelines 2017:

Avoiding arrangements that may create barriers to participation

- Voters in high deprivation areas, in particular, in the Nelson Park Ward, are given particular representation under the current ward structure. Over three quarters of the Napier population know their ward.

Not splitting recognised communities of interest between electoral subdivisions

- The Ahuriri and Taradale Wards have more commonality than the Onekawa-Tamatea, and Nelson Park Wards. There is also a difference in communities of interest between each Ward.

Not grouping together two or more communities of interest that have few common interests

- As above, and the only communities of interest that do not fit completely within the current ward structure are the ones who have very distinct characteristics, which are unlikely to fit completely within any ward structure, e.g. Maraenui, Bayview, Meeanee/Awatoto, and Poraiti. Community Boards were looked at as an option for some of these communities

Accessibility, size, and configuration of the area

- Although Napier is geographically small and geography alone may not inhibit access to Council, the evidence shows that there are differences in the ability for voters to access Council – e.g. barriers for some residents can include education qualifications, access to telecommunications, and even cultural barriers e.g. there is currently only 1 Elected Member of Maori descent, but around 20% of Napier's population is Maori.

3. To consider a 3 ward structure, there has to be rationale to change from the existing ward structure and a 3 ward structure would need to show more effective representation of voters

as analysed against the factors outlined above. In the short-time between the Seminar, and this addendum, a cursory look at what suburbs could be grouped into wards has been made taking the existing Ward structure and suburbs with shared commonality as a starting point, and then balanced against fair representation criteria too to see if it is actually feasible or not.

4. The current ward structure is as follows:

<i>Taradale Ward</i>	<i>Ahuriri Ward</i>	<i>Onekawa-Tamatea Ward</i>	<i>Nelson Park Ward</i>
Taradale South	Bluff Hill	Onekawa Central	Nelson Park
Taradale North	Hospital Hill	Onekawa West	McLean Park
Greenmeadows	Ahuriri	Tamatea North	Onekawa South
Poraiti	Westshore	Tamatea South	Maraenui
Meeanee	Bayview	Northern part of Pirimai	South Marewa
Awatoto (except northern meshblock)	(Northern part) of Onekawa West	Northern part of Marewa	South Pirimai
			Northern meshblock of Awatoto

5. Some suburbs are firmly rooted in the existing ward structure and for others there could be an argument made for shifting them into another ward structure.

Taradale Ward:

- Key characteristics – low deprivation, in-land, residential, dependence on shared facilities.
- Defined by Taradale suburbs and Greenmeadows shares many characteristics of the Taradale suburbs.
- Poraiti/Meeanee and Awatoto could be removed as although they share many characteristics with Taradale/Greenmeadows, they are also considered distinct as they involve rural-residential communities, and areas of projected residential growth.

Ahuriri Ward:

- Key characteristics – low deprivation, coastal, residential.
- Defined by Ahuriri, Westshore, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill.
- Bayview could be removed as it is considered distinct as it involves rural-residential. Poraiti, Meeanee and Awatoto could be included as they have shared commonalities with Bayview including all being an area of growth, all with access to Napier's CBD.
- Nelson Park and McLean Park could be included due to the geographical location of these suburbs, coastal, and the CBD and major features along the coast would be contained within one ward.

Onekawa Ward (proposed) based on current wards of Nelson Park and Onekawa-Tamatea:

- Key characteristics – medium to high deprivation, residential, limited shared facilities.
- Defined by Maraenui, Onekawa South, Onekawa Central-West, Tamatea North and South, Pirimai.
- Nelson Park and McLean Park and Northern meshblock of Awatoto could be moved into another ward. Nelson Park contains alot of the CBD and major features in Napier and is coastal. McLean Park is also coastal.

- Tamatea South could be included with the Taradale Ward but this may be confusing to voters who do not know their suburb Tamatea, is actually broken into North and South.

Fair representation

6. Based on estimated population statistics for 2017 from Statistics New Zealand, the following tables outlined which configurations are feasible and the configurations based on 2 members per ward and 6 Elected Members.
7. Of note, given the voters in the Onekawa Ward, in particular residents of Maraenui, Onekawa South, and Marewa are generally among the highest deprivation in Napier, particular consideration should be given to the population-member ratio below to ensure this ratio is higher compared with the other more affluent areas
8. Of the feasible options outlined below, the following models are considered fairest – Option A and Option C. Most of these options however, reduce the number of At Large Elected members to 2.

Option A – Feasible – with 2 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Meeanee, Awatoto, Poraiti	19,590	3	6,530	332	5.36
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Tamatea North & South, Pirimai	24,190	4	6,048	-151	-2.43
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows	18,200	3	6,067	-131	-2.12
Sub-total	61,980	10	6,198		
At large	61,980	2	30,990		
Total	61,980	12	5,163		

Option A – Not feasible - 2 members per ward, 6 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore,	19,590	2	9,797	-535	-5.18

Nelson Park, McLean Park, Meeanee, Awatoto, Poraiti					
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Tamatea North & South, Pirimai	24,190	2	12,095	1,765	17.09
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows	18,200	2	9,100	-1,230	-11.91
Sub-total	61,980	6	10,330		
At large	61,980	6	10,330		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Option B – feasible – 4 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park	15,100	2	7,550	-198	-2.55
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Tamatea North & South, Pirimai	24,190	3	8,063	316	4.08
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Poraiti, Meeanee, Awatoto	22,690	3	7,563	-184	-2.38
Sub-total	61,980	8	7,748		
At large	61,980	4	15,495		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Option B – not feasible - 2 member wards, 6 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park	15,100	2	7,550	-2,780	-26.91

Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Tamatea North & South, Pirimai	24,190	2	12,095	1,765	17.09
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Meeanee, Awatoto, Poraiti	22,690	2	11,345	-1,015	-9.83
Sub-total	61,980	6	10,330		
At large	61,980	6	10,330		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Option C - not feasible - 2 member wards, 6 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Meeanee, Awatoto, Poraiti	19,590	2	9,795	-535	-5.18
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai	128,730	2	9,365	-965	-9.34
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Tamatea North & South	23,660	2	11,830	1,500	14.52
Sub-total	61,980	6	10,330		
At large	61,980	6	10,330		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Option C – feasible – 2 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Meeanee, Awatoto, Poraiti	19,590	3	6,530	332	5.36

Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai	18,730	3	6,243	45	0.73
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Tamatea North & South	23,660	4	6,530	332	5.36
Sub-total	61,980	10	6,198		
At large	61,980	2	30,990		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Option D – feasible – 5 Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Meeanee, Awatoto	17,370	2	8,685	-169	-1.91
Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai	18,730	2	9,365	511	5.77
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Tamatea North & South, Poraiti	25,880	3	8,627	-228	-2.57
Sub-total	61,980	7	8,854		
At large	61,980	5	12,396		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

Option D – unfeasible – 2 member wards

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward: Bayview, Ahuriri, Hospital Hill, Bluff Hill, Westshore, Nelson Park, McLean Park, Meeanee, Awatoto	17,370	2	8,685	-1,645	-15.92

Onekawa Ward: Onekawa West, South, Central, Marewa, Maraenui, Pirimai	18,730	2	12,940	2,610	25.27
Taradale Ward: Taradale North & South, Greenmeadows, Tamatea North & South, Poraiti	25,880	2	12,940	2,610	25.27
Sub-total	61,980	6	10,330		
At large	61,980	6	10,330		
Total	61,980	12	5,165		

B) Fair representation: Mixed system – under current ward structure

9. As advised to Elected Members during the seminar, the analysis paper only included viable options, and outlined that it is not feasible to remove single member wards under the current ward structure under a mixed system. The paper also outlined that it is not feasible to retain 12 Elected Members or reduce the number of Elected members and remove single member wards under a mixed system.

10. The following tables show the non-viable options for reducing the number of At Large Elected Members.

Key finding

11. As outlined in the analysis paper, none of the options below fit within the 10% +/- rule. Option A is the closest to the 10% rule however it only allows for 1 At Large Elected Member and there is no justification for not meeting the rule as it disadvantages voters in Nelson Park Ward with less Elected Members per voter which creates further barrier to their participation.

Option A – 1 At Large Elected Member

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward	10,200	2	5,100	-532	-9.44
Onekawa-Tamatea Ward	10,400	2	5,200	-432	-7.67
Nelson Park Ward	18,750	3	6,250	618	10.98
Taradale Ward	22,600	4	5,650	18	0.32
Sub-total	61,950	11	5,632		
At large	61,950	1	61,950		
Total	61,950	12	5,163		

Option B – 4 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward	10,200	2	5,100	-2,644	-34.14
Onekawa-Tamatea Ward	10,400	2	5,200	-2,544	-32.85
Nelson Park Ward	18,750	2	9,375	1,631	21.07
Taradale Ward	22,600	2	11,300	3,556	45.92
Sub-total	61,950	8	7,744		
At large	61,950	4	15,488		
Total	61,950	12	5,163		

Option C – 3 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward	10,200	2	5,100	-2,644	-34.14
Onekawa-Tamatea Ward	10,400	2	5,200	-2,544	-32.85
Nelson Park Ward	18,750	2	9,375	1,631	21.07
Taradale Ward	22,600	2	11,300	3,556	45.92
Sub-total	61,950	8	7,744		
At large	61,950	3	20,650		
Total	61,950	12	5,163		

Option D – 2 At Large Elected Members

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward	10,200	2	5,100	-1,095	-17.68
Onekawa-Tamatea Ward	10,400	2	5,200	-995	-16.06
Nelson Park Ward	18,750	3	6,250	55	0.89
Taradale Ward	22,600	3	7,533	1,338	21.60
Sub-total	61,950	10	6,195		
At large	61,950	2	30,975		
Total	61,950	12	5,163		

Option E – 5 At Large Elected Members and total number of Elected Members to be 13

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward	10,200	2	5,100	-2,644	-34.14
Onekawa-Tamatea Ward	10,400	2	5,200	-2,544	-32.85
Nelson Park Ward	18,750	2	9,375	1,631	21.07
Taradale Ward	22,600	2	11,300	3,556	45.92
Sub-total	61,950	8	7,744		
At large	61,950	5	12,390		
Total	Total	61,950	13 ¹		

Option F – 3 At Large Elected Members, and reduce the number of total Elected Members to 11

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward	10,200	2	5,100	-2,644	-34.14

¹ To retain a minimum of two seats per ward and 5 At Large increases the overall number to 13.

Onekawa-Tamatea Ward	10,400	2	5,200	-2,544	-32.85
Nelson Park Ward	18,750	2	9,375	1,631	21.07
Taradale Ward	22,600	2	11,300	3,556	45.92
Sub-total	61,950	8	7,744		
At large	61,950	3	20,650		
Total	61,950	11	5,632		

Option G – 2 At Large Elected Members, and reduce the number of total Elected Members to 10

Ward	Population	Elected Members	Population-member ratio	Difference from quota	% Difference from quota
Ahuriri Ward	10,200	2	5,100	-2,644	-34.14
Onekawa-Tamatea Ward	10,400	2	5,200	-2,544	-32.85
Nelson Park Ward	18,750	2	9,375	1,631	21.07
Taradale Ward	22,600	2	11,300	3,556	45.92
Sub-total	61,950	8	7,744		
At large	61,950	2	30,975		
Total	61,950	10	6,195		