

MISSION PLAN CHANGE 12 CULTURAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT



AUTHOR'S COMMENTS

The report was prepared by Mathew Mullany, a member of the Ngāti Pārau hapū, a trustee of Waiohiki marae and the Mana Ahuriri Trust. In the authorship of this report the writer is tasked with preparing this report on behalf of Ngāti Pārau.

CONTENTS

Author's comments	2
Executive Summary	4
Background	6
Map of the Plan Change 12 Boundary	7
Map of Ngati Parau Boundaries	8
Objectives	9
Outputs	9
Methodology	10
Historical Research	11
Mana Whenua consultation.....	18
Conclusion and Recommendations.....	19
References.....	21

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

It gives me great pleasure on behalf of Ngāti Pārau to provide the Napier City Council with this cultural impact assessment regarding Plan Change 12.

The purpose of the assessment is to document the cultural values, interests and associations that Ngāti Pārau has within the plan change area. This will assist the Proposed Plan Change 12 decision-makers to consider the cultural effects anticipated from the proposal. It will also assist Council officers in summarising and reporting on mana whenua values in relation to the proposed plan change in the report that is required to be prepared for the decision makers. It is anticipated that the information provided will be of considerable interest to the landowners Marist Holdings (Greenmeadows) Limited who has advised Council that, as a Church based organisation and charitable entity, that they have a deep appreciation for the longstanding relationship between the marae and hapū of the area and the Marist Fathers.

Ngāti Pārau is a mana whenua group within the area of Plan Change 12. We use the term Mana Whenua as distinct from Tangata Whenua to underline the unique and continuous relationship that the traditional hapū of the area have with the Napier/Ahuriri area as distinct from Māori resident in the area. The Mana Whenua hapū have contiguous traditional boundaries and act as a collective.

Ngāti Pārau acknowledge the important role that the Marist Holdings Ltd play in the wider community and support Marist Holdings Ltd aspirations to develop their land. Therefore we currently do not object to the Plan Change 12 proposed development on the following basis: -

- It is unlikely that the development has a direct effect on sites of Ngāti Pārau cultural significance
- Regular and active engagement has been established between the applicant and mana whenua who are kaitiaki of Mataruahou

- The applicant group have demonstrated a strong commitment for mana whenua to be actively involved in the progress of the development
- Protocols will be discussed between the applicant, archaeologist and mana whenua with regard to potential archaeological discovery at the site before an authority application to Heritage NZ is made if consent to the plan change is granted
- Feasibility will be determined to incorporate cultural values into the design planning of the development

BACKGROUND

Plan Change 12 provides for a new Mission Special Character Zone that will replace existing zones across 288.6ha of land owned by Marist Holdings (Greenmeadows) Limited. The property is currently under a mixture of zonings in the District Plan that includes the Western Hills Residential Zone (51ha), Rural Residential Zone (207ha) and the Main Rural Zone (31ha). The proposed plan change has reassessed the opportunities for this site and created objectives for the purpose of improving future development outcomes.

Under the proposal the land will be divided into four precincts: residential, landscape and visitor, productive rural, and rural residential. Development objectives for the proposed future of the MHL land have been formulated in consultation with Council. These development objectives are to:

- Protect the visual amenity value of this landscape as a backdrop to Taradale and the City of Napier and the integrity of the skyline;
- Provide connectivity as a walkway link across the Western Hills;
- Provide connectivity as part of an ecological corridor within the City Reserves Network; and
- Provide a different style of residential opportunity in Napier.

The Archaeological Assessment of Environmental Effects (AEE) report that accompanies the Plan Change describes 11 recorded archaeology sites on the Mission Estate land that have been identified between 1996 and 2011. Of these, 10 relate to Māori occupation. The archaeological report assesses the effect of the development on these archaeological sites in terms of archaeological values.

However, the report, quite appropriately, does not include an assessment of the sites in terms of Māori values related to cultural associations and traditions as such assessments should only be made by, or on behalf of, the iwi/hapū that hold mana whenua in the area.

MAP OF THE PLAN CHANGE 12 AREA



MAP OF APPROXIMATE NGATI PARAU BOUNDARIES



OBJECTIVES

The objectives of a cultural impact assessment are to:

- Document the cultural values and the cultural significance of the plan change area;
- Provide recommendations on how mana whenua, Council and the landowners can work together to avoid, remedy or mitigate any potential adverse effects of the proposed activities on cultural values.

OUTPUTS

The cultural impact assessment addresses the following outputs sought by the Napier Council which are:

- Hapū associated with this area will gain a broader understanding of the proposed plan change
- Marist Holdings (Greenmeadows) Limited and Council will gain a clearer understanding of cultural values held over the land that is subject to the plan change proposal
- Marist Holdings (Greenmeadows) Limited and Council will gain a clearer understanding of the potential effects of the proposal on cultural values along with any suggested methods for recognising and providing for the relationship of mana whenua with the plan change area, allowing these matters to better be taken into account in both the reporting on, and decision making for Proposed Plan Change 12
- All parties shall develop a level of confidence and understanding through the evolution of a relationship between mana whenua, Marist Holdings (Greenmeadows) Limited and Council.

METHODOLOGY

The following methods were used to prepare the CIA report:

- A review of the background information that accompanies the proposed plan change proposal, and additional information.
- Hui and interviews with mana whenua with knowledge and experience of the area
- A Ngāti Pārau hui ā hapū with the Napier City Council and Marist Holdings Ltd to discuss Plan Change 12 and Māori values associated with the site
- Distribution of a draft report to hapū representatives and incorporation of feedback from these parties into the final document

HISTORICAL RESEARCH

Through the mana of Turauwha, Taraia, Te Whatuiapiti and later Tareha Te Moananui, Ngāti Pārau has principal hapū interests in the area of the Plan Change 12 proposal. Sites of cultural significance within the specific area of the plan change 12 proposal are sparse and to provide a better indicator of the extent to which Ngāti Pārau maintains mana whenua over the area, a closer examination of sites of cultural significance on the edges of the plan change 12 proposal area are deemed necessary to outline and are worthy of consideration for the purposes of the report.

Te Umuroimata

Te Umuroimata is located on the low isolated hill between the mainland Wharerangi cemetery and Park Island cemetery. Before the 1931 earthquake, it was surrounded by the waters of Te Whanganui ā Orotu. It was occupied by Ngāti Pārau chief Te Kereru son of Hikawera II and the chieftaness Te Rangimokai¹. Te Kereru married two sisters Iwikohurehure and Taotahi of Ngāti Hinepare. According to Parsons, the inhabitants were attacked by a visiting war party and successfully defended the pā. As the slain enemies were transported to be burnt after the battle, the women wailed after the death of their own warriors killed in battle, hence the name Te Umuroimata².

Pukekura

Pukekura pā (otherwise known as the sugar loaf) is a site of cultural significance known to Māori as the site of a whare wānanga. Little is known about the pā other than there is a connection

¹ P. Parsons, *Napier City Heritage Study: Places of Spiritual Significance to Māori*, July 1997, Napier, p.17

² Ibid p.17

between the whare wānanga site there and the whare wānanga at Waimarama. According to notes on the battle of Te Roroipi the pā also contained fern root grounds³.

Te Whanganui ā Orotu

Te Whanganui ā Orotu (otherwise known as Napier inner harbor) is a site of cultural significance to Māori. Prior to European settlement, the lagoon covered an area of about 9,500 acres (3800 ha) and was separated from the sea by a narrow bank or spit. Two main rivers discharged into the lagoon, the Waiohinganga (Esk) and the Tutaekuri⁴. Māori tradition relates how openings to the sea were made at Keteketerau and Ruahoro near Petane, and at Ahuriri near Mataruahou (Scinde Island)⁵. Traditional Māori history shows that Te Whanganui ā Orotu was a 'place of abundance' for freshwater fish, shellfish and birds and much prized as a food resource by the people who have been living on its shores and islands for over 1000 years. With the arrival of Ngāti Kahungunu it was also known as Te Maara a Tawhao (the garden of Tawhao, Tawhao being the chief who imposed a tapu on it⁶.

Otātara pā

Otātara pā is a strategic hilltop location that was home to the principal chief Turauwha. He was descended from Pania, Te Orotu and Whatumamoa. A great battle between ensued between his people and Te Aokoaupari the pā's previous occupants to claim the pā. According to Wiramina Ngahuka in 1888, Turauwha welcomed Taraia I and his people to live among them at Otātara pā⁷. Over successive generations and intermarriages the whakapapa of Turauwha and Taraia became intertwined. Eventually it was Hikawera II son of Te Huhuti and Te Whatuiapiti

³ Private correspondence with P. Parsons 15.08.2018

⁴ J.D.H. Buchanan, *The Māori History and Place Names of Hawke's Bay*, Wellington, A.H. and A.W. Reed, 1973, p.30

⁵ Waitangi Tribunal, *Te Whanganui a Orotu Report*, Wai 55, Wellington, Legislation Direct, 1995, p.3

⁶ *Ibid* p.3

⁷ Ahuriri Hapū Deed of Settlement of Historical Claims, 2 November 2016, Wellington, p.8-9

who lived at Otātara pā⁸. The small ditch and bank defences of the pā point to its antiquity and it is thought that Ōtātara may have been settled between 1400 and 1500. Otātara pā commanded good views of rich kumara gardens, fishing, fowling and flax and raupō resources in the swamps and the then-navigable Tūtaekurī River.

Māori occupation over the area before the Treaty

Prior to British colonization a prominent chief that is associated within the area (of plan change 12) is Te Whatuiapiti – a renowned fighting chief. A descendant of Kahungunu and Hikawera I, Te Whatuiapiti reclaimed the area at a battle known as Te Roropipi by reconquering lost territory⁹. Whatuiapiti hid his troops in the bush at Paherumanihi near Korokipo. Whatuiapiti sent a party of his men to survey the enemy encampment at Takutai Te Rangī occupied by the Ngāti Rakaipaka.¹⁰ After military observation Whatuiapiti split his men into two groups strategically placed to attack the enemy. Once the occupants had vacated the pā in search of kai they were ambushed, killed and Whatuiapiti's warriors seized the pā. The name of where the battle took place was Te Roropipi and therefore it is a wāhi tapū (site of spiritual significance) to Ngāti Pārau.

Acquisition of the Ahuriri Block from Māori ownership

Before 1851, Māori had sole ownership of the area previously known as the Ahuriri Block within the area of the current plan change 12 proposal. The area within the plan change sits historically within the Ahuriri Block, estimated to contain 265,000 acres and was purchased from the Māori of the Ahuriri district for £1,500 on Monday 17 November, 1851¹¹. Tareha Te Moananui was the principal negotiator and the first Māori signatory on the deed of purchase. In his diary McLean

⁸ Ibid p.9

⁹ P. Parsons, *Napier Heritage Study*, p.18

¹⁰ Ibid p.18

¹¹ P. Parsons, *The Ahuriri Block: Māori Customary Interests*, Wai 400 Treaty Claim, May 1997 p.1

notes that he negotiated the block boundaries with Tareha and Te Moananui including the reserves on Mataruahou¹². The following boundaries are quoted from Turton's Deeds:

*'The boundaries of the land as agreed upon ourselves at our first meeting for negotiation with Mr. McLean are these: Commencing at the place where the Tutaekuri and Puremu Rivers discharge themselves into the sea, the boundary runs in the Puremu to Tamahinu on reaching which place it runs in the Tutaekuri to Ohakau when it leaves the Tutaekuri and proceeds along the survey line to Tareha's post at Umukiwi and along the survey line of Mr. Park the surveyor and ourselves to Kohurau on reaching which place it proceeds to the confluence of the Waiharakeke and Ngaruroro rivers thence the boundary runs along the ridge of Te Kaweka to the confluence of the Mangatutu and Mohaka Rivers and on in the course of the Mohaka to Mangowhata and on in the Mangowhata Stream to the Taupo road and along the said road to Titiokura and along the said road to Kaiwhaka and in the course of the Kaiwhaka to Opotamanui thence to Waiohinganga to Whanganui a Orotu thence to our reserve at Te Niho thence to Te Rere o Tawaki where our reserve ends, the boundary continues thence to Te Puka and on to the Puremu River.'*¹³

Parsons notes that the extent to which a fixed boundary line existed in the water between the Ngāti Pārau and neighboring hapū Ngāti Hinepare was a point of conjecture but the southern shoreline of Te Whanganui a Orotu from the Ahuriri heads around to Park Island and Te Umuroimata where Ngāti Pārau had a canoe landing appeared to be within their hapū boundary¹⁴.

¹² *Journal of D. McLean*, 10 November – 10 December, 1851, Alexander Turnbull Library, Reference Number: MS-1234. Object #1030509 p.8

¹³ H. Hanson Turton, *Māori Deeds of Land Purchases in the North Island of New Zealand*, Vol I., George Didsbury, Wellington, 1877, p.491

¹⁴ P. Parsons, *The Ahuriri Block*, p.137

Archaeological research on Plan Change 12 Area

According to an archaeological report commissioned by Marist Holdings Ltd, there is some evidence to suggest historical Māori occupation of the area within the plan change 12 proposal.

In 1996, local Māori historian Pat Parsons recorded a pit site, V21/269, on one of the south-facing spurs overlooking the Mission flats. In 1998 Elizabeth Pishief surveyed an area in the north of the property for a proposed subdivision which did not eventuate. She recorded six archaeological sites: V21/270 through to V21/276. The area was revisited by Pishief in 2003 as part of an assessment for a proposed road realignment. Authority 2005/142 was granted for pine removal works. Harvesting around V21/270 was carried out under Authority 2005/15432¹⁵.

In 2010, Diane Harlowe of Architage Heritage Consultancy identified eight sites in the form of terraces, pits and midden. The identification of these sites may suggest evidence of historical Māori occupation¹⁶. Harlowe also notes the assessment that: *“if consent for the plan change is granted, the implementation of the proposed activity has the potential to affect unidentified subsurface archaeological remains which may be exposed during development. It is advised that an updated archaeological assessment be prepared prior to application for a resource consent which would include a recommendation that an authority application be submitted to Heritage NZ”*¹⁷. Therefore, Ngāti Pārau hapū anticipates further consultation regarding its cultural values if an authority application to Heritage NZ is submitted.

¹⁵ Barr, C. Archaeological Assessment Proposed Subdivision Puketitiri Road. Opus International Consultants Unpublished report prepared for Marist Holdings Ltd. 2005 p.2-4

¹⁶ Archeological AEE report to Marist Holdings (Greenmeadows) Limited with regard to Proposed Mission Special Character Zone, prepared by Dianne Harlow, November 2016, p.36-44

¹⁷ Ibid p.58

Historical connection between the Marist community and Ngāti Pārau

An early connection that exists between the Marist community at Meeanee and Ngāti Pārau concerns two notable personalities, Mother Mary Aubert and Tareha Te Moananui and their involvement in the life and death of Kereopa Te Rau. On 21 December 1871 Kereopa Te Rau, one of the five original disciples of Pai Marire, stood trial at the Supreme Court at Napier for the murder of Carl Volkner - a Christian missionary suspected of collusion with the Government by the Te Whakatohea people. Kereopa was widely believed to have instigated the killing although maintained in cross examination he did not participate in the actual hanging and therefore was not present when Volkner was killed. There was no direct proof of his responsibility for the killing, but a European witness Samuel Levy testified that he had seen Kereopa among those who escorted Volkner to the willow tree. On the basis of this evidence Kereopa was convicted of murder and sentenced to death¹⁸.

William Colenso appealed unsuccessfully for clemency on the grounds that the crime had already been punished by executions and land confiscation.

Mother Mary Aubert, of Father Reignier's mission at Meeanee, was with Kereopa before he was to be executed. They spent time praying and preparing him for life after death. Mother Aubert remained passionate in his defence mainly because she believed he saved Father Grange, a Catholic priest in Opotiki at the time from receiving a similar fate to Volkner. However when sentencing was imposed she consigned herself to the fact that the death penalty would be imposed. In the days before his execution a fight ensued between the English Bishop of Waiapu and the Catholic community. The Bishop of Waiapu appealed unsuccessfully to deny Mother Aubert an audience with Kereopa on the basis that 'mischief would be excited'. Mother Aubert

¹⁸ *Story: Aubert, Mary Joseph*, Te Ara Encyclopedia of New Zealand, Biography, p. 1

had also brought Father Forest to spend time with Kereopa and to pray with him in his last days. Mother Aubert spent his last night in the gaol before he was hanged on 5 January 1871¹⁹.

Kereopa was buried by Tareha, an Ahuriri chief, at Waiohiki. His final resting place is under an old blue gum tree on the burial ground of the Ngai Tahu Ahi people across the road from Waiohiki marae about 12km southwest of Napier²⁰.

Summary of Historical Evidence

Detailing information regarding the Ngāti Pārau sites of cultural significance serve to reinforce the cultural values, traditions and associations with the area. Through the mana of Turauwha, Taraia, Te Whatuiapiti and later Tareha Te Moananui, Ngāti Pārau has principal hapū interests in the area of the Plan Change 12 proposal. There are a number of sites of significance to Ngāti Pārau on the periphery of the plan change area to reinforce the connection between the Ngāti Pārau hapū and the land.

There is also a body of evidence to support the existing theory that historical Māori occupation of the area within the plan change is probable. It is anticipated that if the plan change consent is granted, the nominated archaeologist and Marist Holdings Ltd will work with Ngāti Pārau in further detail to acknowledge the cultural values and associations of Ngāti Pārau in the area.

There is a longstanding connection between the Marist community and Ngāti Pārau that dates back 146 years to the time the province and the country were being established.

¹⁹ J. Munro, *The Story of Suzanne Aubert*, Bridget Williams Books, Wellington, 1996 p.122

²⁰ Private correspondence between Millie Hadfield and Nigel Hadfield, Waiohiki 18 June 1994

MANA WHENUA CONSULTATION

On Sunday 12 August representatives of the Napier City Council and Mission Estate Winery met with Ngāti Pārau hapū members. Richard Munneke Director City Strategy and Kim Anstey Policy Planner from the Napier City Council and Peter Holley Chief Executive Officer of Marist Holdings Ltd and Philip McKay Senior Consultant from Mitchell Daysh were present at the hui.

There were ten hapū members present at the hui. The purpose of the meeting was for hapū members to gain a broader understanding of the proposed plan change and for Marist Holdings Limited and Council to gain a clearer understanding of the cultural values held over the land that is subject to the plan change proposal.

There were no objections to the plan change proposal from hapū members at the meeting. Although there was a particular concern about storm water and how that would be considered as part of the plan change proposal.

Hapū members indicated that they would like to be an active stakeholder and Treaty partner in the development. Suggestions such as the erection of pou, the gifting of names, blessing the site, providing information regarding Māori occupation at the site were all tangible examples of effective partnership. Although no commitments were made, Marist Holdings Ltd is open to developing a relationship with Ngāti Pārau. At the end of the meeting they gave a verbal commitment to attending another hui ā hapū before Christmas.

Therefore on the basis that there were no objections from hapū members at the meeting and subject to further korero with Marist Holdings Ltd, the hapū is supportive of the proposed plan change 12 development.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Therefore, this cultural impact assessment has documented the Ngāti Pārau hapū cultural values, interests and Māori associations within the plan change area. The report has identified various cultural sites of significance in the context of the plan change area and has captured the views of hapū members and their response in relation to the plan change proposal.

Therefore, on the basis of evidence presented, Ngāti Pārau currently does not object to the Plan Change 12 proposal on the following basis:

- It is unlikely that the development has a direct effect on sites of Ngāti Pārau cultural significance
- Regular and active engagement has been established and will continue between the applicant and mana whenua who are kaitiaki of Mataruahou
- The applicant group have demonstrated a strong commitment for mana whenua to be actively involved in the progress of the development
- Protocols will be discussed between the applicant, archaeologist and mana whenua with regard to potential archaeological discovery at the site before an authority application to Heritage NZ is made if the consent to the plan change is granted
- Feasibility will be determined to incorporate cultural values into the design planning of the development

Recommendations

The following recommendations are sought to Council on the proposed plan change. That:

- The Napier City Council (**Council**) considers the evidence of this report
- The Council amends the plan change to ensure mana whenua values are recognized in the design outcomes of Plan Change 12

- That Council (where necessary) will facilitate a dialogue between Ngāti Pārau hapū and Marist Holdings Ltd to ensure an active partnership is maintained throughout the development
- This may include: the erection of pou on the development, the possible gifting of names for precincts, streets or reserve names, the blessing of particular sites and the acknowledgement of stories in the form of plaques or memorials in the area

REFERENCES

1. Parsons, P., *Napier City Heritage Study: Places of Spiritual Significance to Māori*, Napier, 1997
2. Buchanan, J.D.H., *The Māori History and Place Names of Hawke's Bay*, Wellington, A.H. and A.W. Reed, 1973
3. Waitangi Tribunal, *Te Whanganui a Orotu Report*, Wai 55, Wellington, Legislation Direct, 1995
4. Ahuriri Hapū Deed of Settlement of Historical Claims, 2 November 2016, Wellington
5. Parsons, P., *The Ahuriri Block: Māori Customary Interests*, Wai 400 Treaty Claim, May 1997
6. McLean. D, *Journal of Donald McLean*, 10 November – 10 December, 1851, Alexander Turnbull Library, Reference Number: MS-1234.
7. Hanson Turton, H., *Māori Deeds of Land Purchases in the North Island of New Zealand*, Vol I., George Didsbury, Wellington, 1877
8. Barr, C., *Archaeological Assessment Proposed Subdivision Puketitiri Road*. Opus International Consultants Unpublished report prepared for Marist Holdings Ltd. 2005
9. Harlow, D., *Archeological AEE report to Marist Holdings (Greenmeadows) Limited with regard to Proposed Mission Special Character Zone*, November 2016
10. *Te Ara Encyclopedia of New Zealand*, <https://teara.govt.nz/en>
11. Munro, J., *The Story of Suzanne Aubert*, Bridget Williams Books, Wellington, 1996
12. Hadfield, M., Hadfield H., private correspondence, 18 June, 1994